

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA

NORTH CAROLINA STATE  
CONFERENCE OF THE NAACP, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

PATRICK LLOYD MCCRORY, in his  
official capacity as the Governor of North  
Carolina, *et al.*,

Defendants.

**UNITED STATES' MOTION TO  
EXCLUDE EXPERT  
TESTIMONY OF DR. STEPHAN  
THERNSTROM**

Civil Action No. 1:13-cv-658

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF  
NORTH CAROLINA, *et al.*,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, *et  
al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:13-cv-660

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA, *et  
al.*,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:13-cv-861

Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 702, Plaintiff United States, by and through the undersigned attorneys, moves this Court for an order excluding the testimony of Defendants' expert witness, Dr. Stephan S. Thernstrom, as well as any reports by him that Defendants may seek to submit as exhibits. As set forth in the accompanying memorandum in support of this motion, Dr. Thernstrom should be precluded from testifying because his testimony does not meet the requirements for admissible expert testimony set forth in *Daubert v. Merrell Dow Pharm., Inc.*, 509 U.S. 579 (1993) .

The United States has conferred with Defendants regarding this motion and has been advised that Defendants oppose it.

Dated: January 18, 2016

RIPLEY RAND  
United States Attorney  
Middle District of North Carolina

JUSTIN LEVITT  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Rights Division

/s/ Gill P. Beck  
GILL P. BECK  
NCSB # 13175  
Special Assistant United States Attorney  
Office of the United States Attorney  
United States Courthouse  
100 Otis Street  
Asheville, NC 28801  
Phone: (828) 259-0645  
gill.beck@usdoj.gov

/s/ Avner Shapiro  
T. CHRISTIAN HERREN, JR.  
JOHN A. RUSS IV  
TIMOTHY F. MELLETT  
CATHERINE MEZA  
DAVID G. COOPER  
ELIZABETH M. RYAN  
JENIGH J. GARRETT  
AVNER SHAPIRO  
ERNEST A. McFARLAND  
Attorneys, Voting Section  
Civil Rights Division  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Room 7254-NWB  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20530  
Phone: (800) 253-3931  
Fax: (202) 307-3961  
[avner.shapiro@usdoj.gov](mailto:avner.shapiro@usdoj.gov)

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on January 18, 2016, I served the foregoing **United States' Motion to Exclude Testimony of Stephen Thernstrom** upon all counsel of record by electronic mail, with the consent of the parties:

***Counsel for Defendants North Carolina and SBOE:***

Alexander McC. Peters  
Senior Deputy Attorney General  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 629  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
Email: apeters@ncdoj.gov

Thomas A. Farr  
Phillip J. Strach  
Ogletree, Deakins, Nash, Smoak, &  
Stewart, P.C.  
4208 Six Forks Road, Suite 1100  
Raleigh, NC 27609  
Email: phil.strach@odnss.com  
Email: thomas.farr@odnss.com

***Counsel for the NAACP Plaintiffs:***

Penda D. Hair  
Edward A. Hailes, Jr.  
Denise D. Lieberman  
Donita Judge  
Caitlin Swain  
Advancement Project  
Suite 850  
1220 L Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 728-9557  
Email: phair@advancementproject.org

Irving Joyner  
NCSB # 7830  
P.O. Box 374  
Cary, NC 27512  
Email: ijoyner@ncsu.edu

Adam Stein  
NCSB # 4145  
Of Counsel  
Tin Fulton Walker & Owen, PLLC  
312 West Franklin Street  
Chapel Hill, NC 27516  
Phone: (919) 240-7089  
Email: astein@tinfulton.com

Daniel T. Donovan  
Susan M. Davies  
K. Winn Allen  
Anne Dechter  
Kirkland & Ellis, LLP  
655 Fifteenth Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 879-5000  
Email: Daniel.donovan@kirkland.com

***Counsel for the League of Women  
Voters Plaintiffs:***

Anita S. Earls  
Allison J. Riggs  
Southern Coalition for Social Justice  
1415 Highway 54, Suite 101  
Durham, NC 27707  
Phone: (919) 323-3380, x 115  
Email: anita@southerncoalition.org

Dale Ho  
Julie A. Ebenstein  
ACLU Voting Rights Project  
125 Broad Street  
New York, NY 10004  
Phone: (212) 549-2693  
Email: dale.ho@aclu.org

Laughlin McDonald  
ACLU Voting Rights Project  
2700 International Tower  
229 Peachtree Street, N.E.  
Atlanta, GA 30303  
Phone: (404) 500-1235  
Email: lmcDonald@aclu.org

Christopher Brook  
ACLU of North Carolina Legal  
Foundation  
P.O. Box 28004  
Raleigh, NC 27611-8004  
Phone: (919) 834-3466  
Email: cbrook@acluofnc.org

***Counsel for the North Carolina  
Governor:***

Karl S. Bowers, Jr.  
P.O. Box 50549  
Columbia, SC 29250  
Phone: (803) 260-4124  
Email: butch@butchbowers.com  
Robert C. StephensNCSB # 4150

General Counsel  
Officer of the Governor of North  
Carolina  
20301 Mail Service Center  
Raleigh, NC 27699  
Phone: (919) 814-2027  
Email: bob.stephens@nc.gov

***Counsel for Duke Plaintiff-Intervenors:***

Marc E. Elias  
John M. Devaney  
Elisabeth C. Frost  
Perkins Coie LLP  
700 Thirteenth St. NW, Suite 600  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 654-6200  
Email: melias@perkinscoie.com  
Email: jdevaney@perkinscoie.com  
Email: efrost@perkinscoie.com

Edwin M. Speas, Jr.  
John W. O'Hale  
Caroline P. Mackie  
Poyner Spruill LLP  
301 Fayetteville St., Suite 1900  
Raleigh, NC 27601  
Phone: (919) 783-6400  
Email: espeas@poynerspruill.com  
Email: johale@poynerspruill.com  
Email: cmackie@poyerspruill.com

/s/ Avner Shapiro  
AVNER SHAPIRO  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Rights Division - Voting Section  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20530  
Phone: (800) 253-3931  
Email: Avner.Shapiro@usdoj.gov

