

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA

NORTH CAROLINA STATE  
CONFERENCE OF THE NAACP,  
EMMANUEL BAPTIST CHURCH, NEW  
OXLEY HILL BAPTIST CHURCH,  
BETHEL A. BAPTIST CHURCH,  
COVENANT PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH,  
CLINTON TABERNACLE AME ZION  
CHURCH, BARBEE'S CHAPEL  
MISSIONARY BAPTIST CHURCH, INC.,  
ROSANELL EATON, ARMENTA EATON,  
CAROLYN COLEMAN, BAHEEYAH  
MADANY, JOCELYN FERGUSON-  
KELLY, FAITH JACKSON, AND MARY  
PERRY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

PATRICK LLOYD MCCRORY, in his  
official capacity as the Governor of North  
Carolina, KIM WESTBROOK STRACH, in  
her official capacity as Executive Director of  
the North Carolina State Board of Elections,  
JOSHUA B. HOWARD, in his official  
capacity as Chairman of the North Carolina  
State Board of Elections, RHONDA K.  
AMOROSO, in her official capacity as  
Secretary of the North Carolina State Board  
of Elections, JOSHUA D. MALCOLM, in his  
official capacity as a member of the North  
Carolina State Board of Elections, PAUL J.  
FOLEY, in his official capacity as a member  
of the North Carolina State Board of Elections  
and MAJA KRICKER, in her official capacity  
as a member of the North Carolina State  
Board of Elections,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:13-CV-658

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF  
NORTH CAROLINA, A. PHILIP  
RANDOLPH INSTITUTE, UNIFOUR  
ONESTOP COLLABORATIVE, COMMON  
CAUSE NORTH CAROLINA, GOLDIE  
WELLS, KAY BRANDON, OCTAVIA  
RAINEY, SARA STOHLER, and HUGH  
STOHLER,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA,  
JOSHUA B. HOWARD in his official  
capacity as a member of the State Board of  
Elections, RHONDA K. AMOROSO in her  
official capacity as a member of the State  
Board of Elections, JOSHUA D. MALCOLM  
in his official capacity as a member of the  
State Board of Elections, PAUL J. FOLEY in  
his official capacity as a member of the State  
Board of Elections, MAJA KRICKER in her  
official capacity as a member of the State  
Board of Elections, and PATRICK L.  
MCCRORY in his official capacity as  
Governor of the state of North Carolina,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:13-CV-660

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA; THE  
NORTH CAROLINA STATE BOARD OF  
ELECTIONS; and KIM W. STRACH, in her  
official capacity as Executive Director of the

Civil Action No. 1:13-CV-861

North Carolina State Board of Elections,  Defendants.
---

**MOTION TO CONSOLIDATE AND MOTION TO PARTICIPATE IN THE  
DECEMBER 12, 2013 SCHEDULING CONFERENCE**

Pursuant to Rule 42 of the Federal Rules of Civil Procedure, the United States of America respectfully moves to consolidate *United States v. North Carolina*, No. 1:13-cv-861 (M.D.N.C.), with *North Carolina State Conference of the NAACP v. McCrory*, No. 1:13-cv-658 (M.D.N.C.) [hereinafter “NAACP”], and *League of Women Voters of North Carolina v. North Carolina*, No. 1:13-cv-660 (M.D.N.C.) [hereinafter “LWV”]. The United States is filing the instant motion in all three cases. If consolidation is granted, the case with the lowest case number (*i.e.*, the first filed case, 1:13-cv-658) would be the lead case.

Rule 42(a) establishes that “[i]f actions before the court involve a common question of law or fact, the court may (1) join for hearing or trial any or all matters at issue in the actions; (2) consolidate the actions; or (3) issue any other orders to avoid unnecessary cost or delay.” Where litigation is at an early stage and there are common issues of law and fact, consolidation under Rule 42(a) would serve “the interests of justice by avoiding inconsistent results, and would further judicial efficiency and economy by conserving resources.” *Capacchione v. Charlotte-Mecklenburg Bd. of Educ.*, 179 F.R.D. 177, 179 (W.D. N.C. 1998). “[C]onsolidation is particularly appropriate when the actions are likely to involve substantially the same witnesses and

arise from the same series of events or facts,” *Anderson v. Wade*, No. 3:05-CV-33, 2007 WL 2934874, at \*1 (W.D. N.C. Oct. 5, 2007) (internal quotation marks and citations omitted), and “considerations of judicial economy strongly favor simultaneous resolution of all claims growing out of one event,” *Ikerd v. Lapworth*, 435 F.2d 197, 204 (7th Cir. 1970).

*United States v. North Carolina* is a challenge under Section 2 of the Voting Rights Act, 42 U.S.C. § 1973, to portions of North Carolina House Bill 589 (2013) that reduce the period during which voters may cast one-stop absentee ballots (the “early voting period”), eliminate same-day voter registration during the early voting period, prohibit the counting of provisional ballots cast by voters who attempt to vote in their county but outside their home precinct, and impose a new photo identification requirement for in-person voters. This case raises common questions of both law and fact with the Section 2 and Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendment claims against HB 589 currently before this court in the *NAACP* and *LWV* cases. The *NAACP* case brings challenges under Section 2 and the Fourteenth and Fifteenth Amendments to the same portions of HB 589 challenged in *United States v. North Carolina*, among others. The *LWV* case brings challenges under Section 2 and the Fourteenth Amendment to portions of HB 589 that reduce the early voting period, eliminate same-day voter registration during the early voting period, and prohibit the counting of provisional ballots cast by voters who attempt to vote in their county but outside their home precinct.

In light of the complexity of these common questions, consolidation would “enhance efficiency and economy for all concerned,” *Hanes Cos. v. Ronson*, 712 F. Supp. 1223, 1230 (M.D. N.C. 1988), and should therefore be granted.

On November 15 and 25, 2013, the parties, including the United States, met and conferred pursuant to Rule 26(f) to discuss discovery and the schedule in these cases, and the parties will file Rule 26(f) reports on December 5, 2013. The Court has scheduled a scheduling conference in the *NAACP* and *LWV* cases on December 12, 2013, if the parties are not able to reach an agreement on a discovery plan. *See* Notice, *NAACP v. McCrory*, 1:13-cv-658 (Oct. 22, 2013) (Docket No. 25); Notice, *League of Women Voters v. North Carolina*, 1:13-cv-660 (Oct. 22, 2013) (Docket No. 27).

The United States intends to file an individual Rule 26(f) report, on December 5, 2013, if the parties are unable to reach agreement on a schedule. The United States also seeks the Court’s permission to participate in the December 12, 2013 scheduling conference with the Court in the *NAACP* and *LWV* cases, if such a conference is held.

In the course of the parties’ Rule 26(f) conference in these cases on November 25, 2013, the parties met and conferred regarding the motion to consolidate. Counsel for the State defendants in the three respective cases advise that the defendants do not oppose consolidation. Counsel for the plaintiffs in the *NAACP* and *LWV* cases advise that plaintiffs support consolidation for purposes of discovery only, but oppose consolidation for other purposes at this time. To date, the parties have not reached agreement on a

proposed schedule, and the parties will likely be filing individual reports pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(f) and Local Rule 16.3 on December 5, 2013.

For the foregoing reasons, the United States moves to consolidate the three cases and to appear in conference scheduled for December 12, 2013.

Dated: November 26, 2013

RIPLEY RAND  
United States Attorney  
Middle District of North Carolina

JOCELYN SAMUELS  
Acting Assistant Attorney General  
Civil Rights Division

GILL P. BECK  
NCSB # 13175  
Special Assistant United States Attorney  
Office of the United States Attorney  
United States Courthouse  
100 Otis Street  
Asheville, NC 28801  
Phone: (828) 259-0645  
gill.beck@usdoj.gov

*/s/ John A. Russ IV*

---

T. CHRISTIAN HERREN, JR.  
JOHN A. RUSS IV  
CATHERINE MEZA  
DAVID G. COOPER  
SPENCER R. FISHER  
ELIZABETH M. RYAN  
Attorneys, Voting Section  
Civil Rights Division  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Room 7254-NWB  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20530  
Phone: (800) 253-3931  
Fax: (202) 307-3961  
john.russ@usdoj.gov  
catherine.meza@usdoj.gov

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that I have filed on November 26, 2013, the foregoing **Motion to Consolidate and Motion to Participate in the December 12, 2013 Scheduling Conference** electronically using the CM/ECF system in case numbers 1:13-CV-861, 1:13-CV-658, and 1:13-CV-660, which will send notification of such filing to the following:

***Counsel for Defendants North Carolina and SBOE***

Alexander McC. Peters  
Senior Deputy Attorney General  
North Carolina Department of Justice  
Post Office Box 629  
Raleigh, NC 27602  
apeters@ncdoj.gov

Thomas A. Farr  
Phillip J. Strach  
Ogletree, Deakins, Nash, Smoak, &  
Stewart, P.C.  
4208 Six Forks Road, Suite 1100  
Raleigh, NC 27609  
Email: phil.strach@odnss.com  
Email: thomas.farr@odnss.com

***Counsel for the NAACP Plaintiffs:***

Penda D. Hair  
Advancement Project  
Suite 850  
1220 L Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 728-9557  
Email: phair@advancement project.org

Irving Joyner  
NCSB # 7830  
P.O. Box 374  
Cary, NC 27512  
Email: ijoyner@nccu.edu

Adam Stein  
NCSB # 4145  
Of Counsel  
Tin Fulton Walker & Owen, PLLC  
312 West Franklin Street  
Chapel Hill, NC 27516  
Phone: (919) 240-7089  
Email: astein@tinfulton.com

Daniel T. Donovan  
Susan M. Davies  
K. Winn Allen  
Uzoma Nkwonta  
Kim Knudson  
Anne Dechter  
Kirkland & Ellis, LLP  
655 Fifteenth Street, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20005  
Phone: (202) 879-5000  
Email: Daniel.donovan@kirkland.com

***Counsel for the League of Women  
Voters Plaintiffs:***

Anita S. Earls  
Allison J. Riggs  
Clare R. Barnett  
Southern Coalition for Social Justice  
1415 Highway 54, Suite 101  
Durham, NC 27707  
Phone: (919) 323-3380, x 115  
Fax: (919) 323-3942  
Email: anita@southerncoalition.org

Dale Ho  
ACLU Voting Rights Project  
125 Broad Street  
New York, NY 10004  
Phone: (212) 549-2693  
Email: dale.ho@aclu.org

Laughlin McDonald  
ACLU Voting Rights Project  
2700 International Tower  
229 Peachtree Street, N.E.  
Atlanta, GA 30303  
Phone: (404) 500-1235  
Email: lmcDonald@aclu.org

Christopher Brook  
ACLU of North Carolina Legal  
Foundation  
P.O. Box 28004  
Raleigh, NC 27611-8004  
Phone: (919) 834-3466  
Fax: (866) 511-1344  
Email: cbrook@acluofnc.org

***Counsel for the North Carolina  
Governor:***

Karl S. Bowers, Jr.  
P.O. Box 50549  
Columbia, SC 29250  
Phone: (803) 260-4124  
Email: butch@butchbowers.com

Robert C. Stephens  
NCSB # 4150  
General Counsel  
Officer of the Governor of North  
Carolina  
20301 Mail Service Center  
Raleigh, NC 27699  
Phone: (919) 814-2027  
Fax: (919) 733-2120  
Email: bob.stephens@nc.gov

*/s/ John A. Russ IV*

---

JOHN A. RUSS IV  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Rights Division - Voting Section  
Room 7254-NWB  
950 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20530  
Phone: (800) 253-3931  
Fax: (202) 307-3961  
Email: john.russ@usdoj.gov

IN THE UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE MIDDLE DISTRICT OF NORTH CAROLINA

NORTH CAROLINA STATE  
CONFERENCE OF THE NAACP,  
EMMANUEL BAPTIST CHURCH, NEW  
OXLEY HILL BAPTIST CHURCH,  
BETHEL A. BAPTIST CHURCH,  
COVENANT PRESBYTERIAN CHURCH,  
CLINTON TABERNACLE AME ZION  
CHURCH, BARBEE'S CHAPEL  
MISSIONARY BAPTIST CHURCH, INC.,  
ROSANELL EATON, ARMENTA EATON,  
CAROLYN COLEMAN, BAHEEYAH  
MADANY, JOCELYN FERGUSON-  
KELLY, FAITH JACKSON, AND MARY  
PERRY,

Plaintiffs,

v.

PATRICK LLOYD MCCRORY, in his  
official capacity as the Governor of North  
Carolina, KIM WESTBROOK STRACH, in  
her official capacity as Executive Director of  
the North Carolina State Board of Elections,  
JOSHUA B. HOWARD, in his official  
capacity as Chairman of the North Carolina  
State Board of Elections, RHONDA K.  
AMOROSO, in her official capacity as  
Secretary of the North Carolina State Board  
of Elections, JOSHUA D. MALCOLM, in his  
official capacity as a member of the North  
Carolina State Board of Elections, PAUL J.  
FOLEY, in his official capacity as a member  
of the North Carolina State Board of Elections  
and MAJA KRICKER, in her official capacity  
as a member of the North Carolina State  
Board of Elections,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:13-CV-658  
[Lead Case]

LEAGUE OF WOMEN VOTERS OF  
NORTH CAROLINA, A. PHILIP  
RANDOLPH INSTITUTE, UNIFOUR  
ONESTOP COLLABORATIVE, COMMON  
CAUSE NORTH CAROLINA, GOLDIE  
WELLS, KAY BRANDON, OCTAVIA  
RAINEY, SARA STOHLER, and HUGH  
STOHLER,

Plaintiffs,

v.

THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA,  
JOSHUA B. HOWARD in his official  
capacity as a member of the State Board of  
Elections, RHONDA K. AMOROSO in her  
official capacity as a member of the State  
Board of Elections, JOSHUA D. MALCOLM  
in his official capacity as a member of the  
State Board of Elections, PAUL J. FOLEY in  
his official capacity as a member of the State  
Board of Elections, MAJA KRICKER in her  
official capacity as a member of the State  
Board of Elections, and PATRICK L.  
MCCRORY in his official capacity as  
Governor of the state of North Carolina,

Defendants.

Civil Action No. 1:13-CV-660  
[Consolidated Case]

UNITED STATES OF AMERICA,

Plaintiff,

v.

THE STATE OF NORTH CAROLINA; THE  
NORTH CAROLINA STATE BOARD OF  
ELECTIONS; and KIM W. STRACH, in her  
official capacity as Executive Director of the  
North Carolina State Board of Elections,

Civil Action No. 1:13-CV-861  
[Consolidated Case]

Defendants.

**[PROPOSED] ORDER**

Upon consideration, the United States' Motion to Consolidate and Motion to Participate in the December 12, 2013 Scheduling Conference (ECF Doc. No. \_\_) is hereby **GRANTED**. All pretrial and trial proceedings in *United States v. North Carolina*, No. 1:13-cv-861 and *League of Women Voters of North Carolina v. North Carolina*, No. 1:13-cv-660, shall be consolidated with proceedings in *North Carolina State Conference of the NAACP v. McCrory*, No. 1:13-cv-658. The case with the lowest case number (*i.e.*, the first filed case) will be the lead case, and all future filings hereafter shall be filed under that case number, No. 1:13-cv-658.

The United States shall participate in the upcoming Rule 26(f) reports filed in *NAACP* and *League of Women Voter* cases, and shall participate in the scheduling conference with the Court scheduled on December 12, 2013, if such a conference is needed.

**SO ORDERED.**

Date: \_\_\_\_\_, 2013

\_\_\_\_\_  
THE HONORABLE THOMAS D. SCHROEDER  
UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE