

IN THE CIRCUIT COURT FOR THE SECOND JUDICIAL CIRCUIT  
IN AND FOR LEON COUNTY, FLORIDA  
CIVIL DIVISION

**ELLEN FEDDER, et al., Plaintiffs,**

v.

Case No. 2006 CA 2996  
(consolidated with  
Case No. 2006 CA 2973)

**FLORIDA ELECTIONS CANVASSING  
COMMISSION, et al, Defendants.**

---

**DEFENDANT SUE M. COBB'S MOTION TO DISMISS COMPLAINT  
FOR FAILURE TO STATE A CLAIM**

Defendants Sue M. Cobb, in her official capacity as Secretary of State of the State of Florida (the "Secretary"), submits this Motion to Dismiss. The Complaint seeks no relief from the Secretary, *see* Prayer for Relief, and there is no relief available from this defendant. The Secretary is not a proper defendant, and she should be dismissed from this action. In support of this Motion, the Secretary respectfully shows this Court the following:

1. This is an action to contest the Florida Elections Canvassing Commission's certification of the election results for Florida's Thirteenth Congressional District. (Compl. ¶ 2.) The action was initiated under Florida's Election Contest Statute, Section 102.168, Florida Statutes. (Compl. ¶ 2.)
2. The Election Contest Statute specifies the proper defendants for election contests. "[T]he Elections Canvassing Commission is an indispensable and proper party defendant in federal, state, and multicounty races." § 102.168(4), Fla. Stat. (2006). In addition, "the successful candidate is an indispensable party to any action brought to contest the election or nomination of a candidate." *Id.*

3. Therefore, under the clear language of the statute, the Elections Canvassing Commission and Vern Buchanan are indispensable and proper party defendants. The statute does not provide for other defendants, and under the general principle of statutory construction, *expressio unius est exclusio alterius*, the mention of one thing implies the exclusion of others. *Thayer v. State*, 335 So. 2d 815, 817 (Fla. 1976). “Hence, where a statute enumerates the things on which it is to operate, or forbids certain things, it is ordinarily to be construed as excluding from its operation all those not expressly mentioned.” *Id.*

4. In an election contest regarding the 2000 disputed presidential election, this Court dismissed then Secretary of State Katherine Harris and other defendants “on the grounds that no affirmative relief could be attained against them based upon the nature of the proceedings.” *Taylor v. Martin County Canvassing Board*, Final Judgment for Defendants, Case No. 00-2850, 2000 WL 1793409 (Fla. Cir. Ct. Dec. 8, 2000) (Lewis, J.). The Florida Election Canvassing Commission and the prevailing candidates remained as defendants. *Id.*

5. The Complaint’s Prayer for Relief asks this Court to order certain relief from the Elections Canvassing Commission, and it asks for a declaration regarding the District 13 Congressional election. It does not ask for any meaningful relief against the Secretary that otherwise cannot be provided by the Florida Elections Canvassing Commission.

**WHEREFORE**, the Secretary asks that this Court dismiss her from the action as an improper defendant against whom no relief may be granted.

Respectfully submitted this 15 day of December, 2006.

---

**PETER ANTONACCI**

Florida Bar No. 280690

**ALLEN C. WINSOR**

Florida Bar No. 016295

**GRAYROBINSON, P.A.**

301 South Bronough Street

Suite 600 (32301)

Post Office Box 11189

Tallahassee, Florida 32302

Telephone (850) 577-9090

Facsimile (850) 577-3311

E-Mail pva@gray-robinson.com

awinsor@gray-robinson.com

*Attorneys for State Defendants*

**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I HEREBY CERTIFY that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been furnished by U.S. Mail and/or Facsimile or Electronic Transmission this 15<sup>th</sup> day of

 2006, to the following:

Mark Herron  
Messer, Caparello & Self, P.A.  
2618 Centennial Place  
Tallahassee, Florida 32308  
Telephone (850) 222-0720  
Facsimile (850) 558-0659  
E-Mail: mherron@lawfla.com  
*Attorney for Plaintiff Jennings*

Kendall Coffey  
Coffey & Wright, LLP  
2665 South Bayshore Drive  
PH-2, Grand Bay Plaza  
Miami, Florida 33133  
Telephone (305) 857-9797  
Facsimile (305) 859-9919  
E-Mail: kcoffey@coffeywright.com  
*Attorney for Plaintiff Jennings*

Donald B. Verrilli, Jr.  
Jessica Ring Amunson  
Sam Hirsch  
Jenner & Block, LLP  
601 Thirteenth Street N.W.  
Washington, DC 20005-3823  
Telephone (202) 693-6095  
*Attorneys for Plaintiff Jennings*

Glenn T. Burhans, Jr.  
Hayden R. Dempsey  
Greenberg Traurig, P.A.  
101 East College Avenue  
Tallahassee, Florida 32301  
Telephone (850) 222-6891  
Facsimile (850) 681-0207  
E-Mail Burhansg@gtlaw.com  
Dempseyh@gtlaw.com  
*Attorney for Vern Buchanan*

Ronald A. Labasky  
Young Van Assenderp, P.A.  
225 South Adams Street  
Tallahassee, Florida 32302  
Telephone (850) 222-7206  
Facsimile (850) 561-6834  
E-Mail rlabasky@yvlaw.net  
*Attorney for Supervisor Dent*

Frederick J. Elbrecht  
Deputy County Attorney  
Sarasota County Attorney's Office  
1660 Ringling Boulevard, Second Floor  
Sarasota, Florida 34236  
Telephone (941) 861-7272  
Facsimile (941) 861-7267  
E-Mail RElbrecht@scgov.net  
*Attorney for Sarasota Defendants*

Lowell Finley  
Voter Action  
1604 Solano Avenue  
Berkeley, California 94707  
Telephone (510) 318-2248  
Facsimile (415) 723-7141  
*Attorney for Fedder Plaintiffs*

Elliott M. Minberg  
Judith E. Schaeffer  
People for the American Way Foundation  
2000 M Street N.W. #400  
Washington, DC 20036  
Telephone (202) 467-4999  
Facsimile (202) 293-2672  
*Attorneys for Fedder Plaintiffs*

Muslima Lewis, Director  
Voting Rights Project  
Randall C. Marshall, Legal Director  
Aziza Naa-Kaa Botchway  
ACLU Foundation of Florida, Inc.  
4500 Biscayne Boulevard, Suite 340  
Miami, Florida 33137-3227  
Telephone (786) 273-2729  
Facsimile (786) 363-1448  
*Attorneys for Fedder Plaintiffs*

Rebecca Harrison Steele  
Zeina N. Salam  
ACLU Foundation of Florida, Inc.  
West Central Florida Office  
Post Office Box 18245  
Tampa, Florida 33679-8245  
Telephone (813) 254-0925  
Facsimile (813) 254-0926  
*Attorneys for Fedder Plaintiffs*

Reginald J. Mitchell  
People for the American Way Foundation  
1550 Melvin Street  
Tallahassee, Florida 32301  
Telephone (850) 877-0307  
Facsimile (850) 402-1999  
*Attorney for Fedder Plaintiffs*

Cindy A. Cohn  
Matthew J. Zimmerman  
Electronic Frontier Foundation  
454 Shotwell Street  
San Francisco, California 94110  
Telephone (415) 436-9333 x 127  
Facsimile (415) 436-9993  
*Attorneys for Fedder Plaintiffs*

Peter Antonacci  
Florida Bar No. 280690  
Allen C. Winsor  
Florida Bar No. 016295  
GrayRobinson, P.A.  
301 South Bronough Street  
Suite 600 (32301)  
Post Office Box 11189  
Tallahassee, Florida 32302  
Telephone (850) 577-9090  
Facsimile (850) 577-3311  
E-Mail pva@gray-robinson.com  
awinsor@gray-robinson.com  
*Attorneys for State Defendants*